

2008

Supporting the use of learning objects in the K-12 environment

Wayne Grant Cotton
University of Wollongong

Follow this and additional works at: <https://ro.uow.edu.au/theses>

University of Wollongong

Copyright Warning

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site.

You are reminded of the following: This work is copyright. Apart from any use permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, no part of this work may be reproduced by any process, nor may any other exclusive right be exercised, without the permission of the author. Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material.

Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Unless otherwise indicated, the views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the views of the University of Wollongong.

Recommended Citation

Cotton, Wayne Grant, Supporting the use of learning objects in the K-12 environment, PhD thesis, Faculty of Education, University of Wollongong, 2008. <http://ro.uow.edu.au/theses/443>

Research Online is the open access institutional repository for the University of Wollongong. For further information contact the UOW Library: research-pubs@uow.edu.au

NOTE

This online version of the thesis may have different page formatting and pagination from the paper copy held in the University of Wollongong Library.

UNIVERSITY OF WOLLONGONG

COPYRIGHT WARNING

You may print or download ONE copy of this document for the purpose of your own research or study. The University does not authorise you to copy, communicate or otherwise make available electronically to any other person any copyright material contained on this site. You are reminded of the following:

Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may be a copyright infringement. A court may impose penalties and award damages in relation to offences and infringements relating to copyright material. Higher penalties may apply, and higher damages may be awarded, for offences and infringements involving the conversion of material into digital or electronic form.

Supporting the use of Learning Objects in the K-12 Environment

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the
requirements for the award of the degree

Doctor of Philosophy

from

The University of Wollongong

by

Wayne Grant Cotton

BEd, MEd, MCompStud.

Faculty of Education

2008

DECLARATION

I, Wayne Cotton, declare that this thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. The document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Signed:

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to wholeheartedly thank my supervisors, Associate Professor Lori Lockyer and Dr. Gwyn Brickell, for their help, inspiration, and encouragement throughout the term of this research. Their thorough appraisal and guidance of my work, and the high priority and prompt attention they gave to their supervision was very greatly appreciated. Their positive attitude made the task enjoyable as well as challenging.

Above all, I wish to thank my close friends Peter, Paul and Tony and their families who have supported me more than they realise throughout this journey. It is to them I owe the greatest debt, and the greatest appreciation.

I dedicate this work to my father, Graeme William Cotton (1947-1984) and grandparents Olwyn (1923-2004) and Bill Cotton (1924 – 2007) who between them taught me to believe in myself, and to strive for success.

ABSTRACT

In recent years there has been an international agenda to make electronic resources, in the form of learning objects, freely available to teachers and students via on-line databases or repositories. To date, much of the work on these resources has focused on the development of learning objects and the technical aspects of the storage and retrieval processes. Less attention has been paid to the way the learning objects are disseminated and how teachers incorporate the objects into teaching and learning activities. Several researchers (Bennett, Lockyer, & Agostinho, 2004; Hand et al., 2004; Kang, Lim, & Kim, 2003; Koper, 2001b; Laurillard & McAndrew, 2003; Lukasiak et al., 2004; Wiley, 2003) suggest that using generic pedagogical frameworks, known as learning designs, may support teachers who wish to make use of these learning objects. This research study sought out to investigate these claims by designing, developing and evaluating a support system to aid K-12 teachers as they attempt to incorporate learning objects into learning designs.

The theories underlying this support system approach are linked to Vygotsky's (1978) concept of the zone of proximal development and the notion of scaffolding to assist a learners in making progress on tasks that would otherwise be out of their reach (Davis & Linn, 2000; Edelson, Gordin, & Pea, 1999; Quintana, Eng, Carra, Wu, & Soloway, 1999; Reiser, 2002). Using these ideas as a base it was theorised that a cognitive tool in the form of an Electronic Performance Support System (EPSS) could provide the necessary scaffolding to aid teachers through the process of integrating learning objects within pedagogically effective frameworks (i.e., learning designs). The specific learning design used in this study was a WebQuest. This framework was selected because WebQuests are widely known within the K-12 community (Dodge, 1995) and because WebQuests require the use of online resources (i.e., learning objects).

To investigate the integration of learning objects within a learning design, a research approach that could encompass the design, development and evaluative nature of the study was needed. One such approach that has been proven to solve similar broad based, complex, real world problems, while at the same time maintaining a commitment

to theory construction and explanation, is Reeves' development research model (Reeves, 2000; Reeves, Herrington, & Oliver, 2004).

Using the development research procedures outlined by Reeves, this study initially involved a needs analysis to identify the issues that K-12 teachers faced when they attempted to incorporate learning objects within a specific learning design. Considering the findings from the needs analysis with current peer reviewed literature, a series of design principles were generated. These principles were then used to inform the design, development and testing of a web-based EPSS.

The findings of the study suggest that when K-12 teachers attempt to incorporate learning objects within a learning design they face issues in four main areas: 1) limitations in their own technological competency when developing WebQuests; 2) issues relating to how teachers manage the time available to create WebQuests; 3) difficulties in searching for and identifying appropriate learning objects; and 4) maintaining the pedagogical quality within the learning designs.

The web-based EPSS developed in this study addressed these issues by supporting the teachers as they incorporated learning designs into their teaching and learning experiences. The EPSS accomplished this by combining specific information, guidance, online tutorials, and a range of pedagogically effective learning design taxonomies into an all encompassing support structure. The study revealed that there are still more opportunities to develop the support system further, particular in relation to managing the time taken to develop WebQuests and to maintaining the pedagogical quality of the teaching and learning experience.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1	10
INTRODUCTION.....	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
<i>Background to the Study</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Statement of the Problem</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>A Learning Design Approach to the Problem.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Scaffolding with Cognitive Tools</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Purposes of the Study.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Significance of the Study.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Research Questions.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Assumptions</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Limitations</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Overview of the Study</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Structure of the Thesis.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
CHAPTER 2	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
LITERATURE REVIEW	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
<i>Introduction.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Learning Objects.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Learning Designs</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Scaffolding</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Summary.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
CHAPTER 3	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
METHODOLOGY	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
<i>Introduction.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Research Approach.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Research Procedures</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Overview of Data Collection Techniques</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Method of Analysis.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Ethical Considerations.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Ensuring Validity and Reliability.....</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>
<i>Conclusion</i>	<i>Error! Bookmark not defined.</i>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1	1
INTRODUCTION.....	1
<i>Background to the Study</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>Statement of the Problem</i>	<i>2</i>
<i>A Learning Design Approach to the Problem.....</i>	<i>3</i>
<i>Scaffolding with Cognitive Tools</i>	<i>4</i>
<i>Purposes of the Study.....</i>	<i>5</i>
<i>Significance of the Study</i>	<i>5</i>
<i>Research Questions.....</i>	<i>5</i>
<i>Assumptions</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>Limitations</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>Overview of the Study</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>Structure of the Thesis.....</i>	<i>8</i>
CHAPTER 2	9
LITERATURE REVIEW	9
<i>Introduction.....</i>	<i>9</i>
<i>Learning Objects.....</i>	<i>9</i>
<i>Learning Designs</i>	<i>23</i>
<i>Scaffolding</i>	<i>39</i>
<i>Summary.....</i>	<i>48</i>
CHAPTER 3	50
METHODOLOGY	50
<i>Introduction.....</i>	<i>50</i>
<i>Research Approach</i>	<i>50</i>
<i>Research Procedures</i>	<i>54</i>
<i>Overview of Data Collection Techniques</i>	<i>70</i>
<i>Method of Analysis.....</i>	<i>71</i>
<i>Ethical Considerations.....</i>	<i>75</i>
<i>Ensuring Validity and Reliability.....</i>	<i>76</i>
<i>Conclusion</i>	<i>77</i>

CHAPTER 4	78
RESULTS AND DISCUSSION.....	78
<i>Introduction.....</i>	78
<i>Participant Profile</i>	79
<i>Stage 1: Needs Analysis and the Creation of Design Principles</i>	83
<i>Stage 2: The Development of a Prototype EPSS.....</i>	107
<i>Stage 3: Evaluating the Prototype EPSS, Continuing the Needs Analysis and Refining the Design Principles</i>	119
<i>Stage 4: Design and Development of a Web-Based EPSS.....</i>	145
<i>Stage 5: Evaluation and Testing the Web-Based EPSS.....</i>	160
<i>Stage 6: The Final Refinement of the Design Principles</i>	181
CHAPTER 5	186
CONCLUSIONS	186
<i>Summary of the Study.....</i>	186
<i>Outcomes Drawn from the Research</i>	189
<i>Design Principles Generated by the Research</i>	195
<i>Discussion about the Research Approach</i>	197
<i>Further Research</i>	198
BIBLIOGRAPHY	200
APPENDIX A	231
ADVERTISEMENT OF WORKSHOPS	231
APPENDIX B	233
WORKSHOP DESCRIPTIONS	233
<i>Outline of Workshop Series One.....</i>	234
<i>Outline of Workshop Series Two.....</i>	235
<i>Outline of Workshop Series Three</i>	236
APPENDIX C	237
SUPPORTING WEB SITE FOR WORKSHOP SERIES 1	237
APPENDIX D	239
GENERAL INFORMATION QUESTIONNAIRE	239

APPENDIX E	241
WEBQUESTS AND RESOURCES SHEET	241
APPENDIX F.....	243
INTERVIEW GUIDE.....	243
APPENDIX G.....	246
WEBQUEST EVALUATION RUBRIC	246
APPENDIX H.....	250
HUMAN RESEARCH ETHICS PERMISSION.....	250
APPENDIX I	253
CONTENT VALIDITY EXPERT REVIEW PANEL	253
APPENDIX J.....	255
WEB-BASED EPSS EXPERT REVIEW PANEL MEMBERS	255
APPENDIX K.....	257
EPSS EXPERT REVIEW TOOL	257
APPENDIX L	262
INFORMATION SHEETS AND CONSENT FORMS	262
APPENDIX M.....	265
RESEARCHER EVALUATIONS OF PARTICIPANT	265
WEBQUESTS FROM STAGE 1	265
APPENDIX N.....	272
RESEARCHER EVALUATIONS OF PARTICIPANT	272
WEBQUESTS FROM STAGE 3	272
APPENDIX O.....	281
RESEARCHER EVALUATIONS OF PARTICIPANT	281
WEBQUESTS FROM STAGE 5	281
APPENDIX P.....	298
PEER REVIEW OF RESEARCH	298

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2-1 A Schematic representation of the hierarchy of elements in the LOM model (Barker, 2005)	14
Figure 2-2 Lights, Camera, Action Film School, a learning object developed by The Learning Federation (2003b) for schools in Australia and New Zealand.....	19
Figure 2-3 The Pond Habitat of the Frog is a simple website with an educational purpose (Zephyrus Education, 2004)	20
Figure 2-4 Elements of a learning design (Oliver, 1999; Oliver & Herrington, 2001) ..	26
Figure 2-5 A design pattern focusing on a group discussion (Goodyear, 2004)	29
Figure 2-6 An example of a LDVS formalised by the Learning Designs Project (Agostinho et al., 2005).....	30
Figure 2-7 A LAMS representation of a learning design (The LAMS Foundation, 2006)	32
Figure 2-8 The similarities between WebQuests and learning designs	38
Figure 3-1 Differences between empirical and development approaches to research as explained by Reeves (2000).....	53
Figure 3-2 An outline of how Reeves' (2000) Development Research model provided a base for the methodology used in this study	56
Figure 3-3 The 4 roles an observer can take while collecting data (Gold 1969)	61
Figure 3-4 An overview of Stage 3 of the Research Project.....	67
Figure 3-5 An overview of Stage 4 of the Research Project.....	68
Figure 4-1 Four screen shots of Participant 1's WebQuest	86
Figure 4-2 An overview indicating how the qualitative and quantitative findings from the initial needs analysis are interconnected	92
Figure 4-3 The introduction page on Participant 9's WebQuest	95
Figure 4-4 Screen captures from Participant 12's WebQuest.....	97
Figure 4-5 Screen captures showing the Introduction, Task, Process and Evaluation page from Participant 2's WebQuest.....	102
Figure 4-6 The first component of the Prototype EPSS – The paper-based flowchart showing the WebQuest design process.....	109
Figure 4-7 A screen shot of the Introduction page of the WebQuest template.....	111
Figure 4-8 A screen shot of the Task page of the WebQuest template.....	112

Figure 4-9 A map of the supporting website.....	114
Figure 4-10 A screen shot of the home page of the supporting website	116
Figure 4-11 A screen shot of the templates page of the supporting website.....	117
Figure 4-12 Four screen shots of Participants 16's WebQuest.....	122
Figure 4-13 Examples of two images generated by Participants 22 and 24 using the free online tool, Flaming Text (Bonnell & Gregory, 2005)	130
Figure 4-14 Screen shots of Participants 19's WebQuest	131
Figure 4-15 Screen shots of two learning objects used in Stage 3 of the research, and similar specifically designed learning objects.....	134
Figure 4-16 Participant 15's WebQuest showing a high level of aesthetics, but low pedagogical structure	136
Figure 4-17 The introductory screen of the web-based EPSS	146
Figure 4-18 The main welcome screen of the web-based EPSS, showing the standardised layout and jigsaw theme, including the Jigsaw Man in the centre of the screen.....	146
Figure 4-19 The learning objects page of the web-based EPSS, containing examples of learning objects and links to a learning object repository	147
Figure 4-20 Step 1 of the EPSS, where users can view a series of templates or an exemplary example of a WebQuest using these templates	148
Figure 4-21 The second step in the web-based EPSS	149
Figure 4-22 The third step of the web-based EPSS showing how the system focuses on the pedagogical aspects of the design.	150
Figure 4-23 A text entry screen where the user replaces the detail instructions with their description of the their task	151
Figure 4-24 The fourth step of the EPSS focuses on another pedagogical element	153
Figure 4-25 A screen shot of the fifth step of the EPSS	154
Figure 4-26 A screen shot of the sixth and final stage of the EPSS.....	155
Figure 4-27 Screen shots from Participant 26 and 27's WebQuests.....	163
Figure 4-28 Participant 29's Learning Design created with the aid of the web-based EPSS.....	173
Figure 4-29 Screen shots of pedagogical attributes of Participant 33's WebQuest	175
Figure 4-30 Screen shots of various WebQuests created using the web-based EPSS ..	177
Figure 5-1 The evolution of development research into design-based research.....	198

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2-1 Various terminology used to describe components of instruction as defined by McGreal (2004b).....	11
Table 2-2 The comparison of terminology between four learning design frameworks and the three elements of a learning design	33
Table 2-3 Lajoie's (2000) benefits of a cognitive tools approach to learning and how they relate to this study	43
Table 3-1 An Overview of the scope of development research in educational settings .	52
Table 3-2 Outline of workshop	58
Table 3-3 Workshop supports supplied via a supporting website	59
Table 3-4 Measures of reliability of the WebQuest evaluation rubric.....	65
Table 3-5 Overview of the data collection techniques used in this research study	71
Table 3-6 Stages of computer aided data analysis undertaken in this study	73
Table 3-7 Coding framework for the qualitative data used in the study.....	74
Table 3-8 Procedures to ensure validity in the Project	77
Table 4-1 Descriptive statistics about the participants.....	80
Table 4-2 Participants' responses to question 6 and 7 of the GIQ.....	81
Table 4-3 How the participants were using computer based resources prior to the study	82
Table 4-4 A brief description of the WebQuests collected after the first series of workshops	85
Table 4-5 The researcher evaluation of Participant 1's WebQuest	87
Table 4-6 The mean scores from three evaluations of the participant's WebQuests in Stage 1 of the research	89
Table 4-7 The prevalence of themes derived from the data collected during Stage 1	91
Table 4-8 The prevalence of technical issues encountered during the first workshop ...	93
Table 4-9 The prevalence of issues relating to web development from the various data types	94
Table 4-10 A summary of the identified themes and constructed design principles from the first stage of the research.....	106
Table 4-11 A description of the WebQuest templates provided by the prototype EPSS	113

Table 4-12 A description of the external links on the supporting website's Helpful Sites page	115
Table 4-13 An outline of how the prototype EPSS meets the guidelines identified from the literature and how it addresses the issues of the participants.....	118
Table 4-14 A description of the WebQuests collected after the second series of workshops	121
Table 4-15 The researcher evaluation of Participant 16's WebQuest.....	124
Table 4-16 The mean scores from three evaluations of the participants' WebQuests in Stage 3 of the research	126
Table 4-17 Comparisons between the means of the WebQuest evaluations from workshop series 1 and workshop series 2	127
Table 4-18 The prevalence of themes derived from the data collected during Stage 3	128
Table 4-19 A summary of the identified themes and the refined design principles after Stage 3 of the research	144
Table 4-20 An overview of the learning object repositories the web-based EPSS links to	152
Table 4-21 An outline of how the web-based EPSS addressed the design principles generated from this research	157
Table 4-22 The prevalence of issues arising from the expert review of the web-based prototype	158
Table 4-23 A description of the WebQuests collected after the third workshop	161
Table 4-24 The researcher evaluation of Participant 26's WebQuest.....	165
Table 4-25 The mean scores from two external evaluations of the participant's WebQuests in Stage 5 of the research.....	167
Table 4-26 Comparisons between the WebQuest evaluations from workshop series 2 and workshop series 3	169
Table 4-27 The prevalence of themes derived from the data collected during Stage 5	171
Table 4-28 An outline of the themes identified from Stage 5 of the research	180
Table 5-1 An overview of the research process undertaken in the project	188
Table 5-2 The design principles generated by this research	196